# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MAINE

M. DIANE KOKEN, AS LIQUIDATOR	)	
ON BEHALF OF RELIANCE INS. CO.	)	
(IN LIQUIDATION),	)	
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
	)	
v.	)	
	)	Civil No. 02-83-B-C
	)	
AUBURN MANUFACTURING, INC.,	)	
ET AL.,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	
	)	

ORDER ON APPELLATE REVIEW OF THE MAGISTRATE
JUDGE'S ORDER (DOCKET ITEM NO. 283) ON AUBURN
MANUFACTURING, INC.'S MOTION FOR SANCTIONS
(DOCKET ITEM NO. 169) AND MOTION TO EXCLUDE AND
STRIKE (DOCKET ITEM NO. 253)

Before the Court on Appellate Review pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(A) is the Magistrate Judge's Order (Docket Item No. 283) on two Motions of Defendant Auburn Manufacturing, Inc. (Docket Item Nos. 169 and 181).

By the Order acting on the Motions, the Magistrate Judge denied the Motion for Sanctions because, after articulating her findings and concerns generated by the Motion, as she so nicely put it, "I do not think that this case presents the appropriate vehicle to impose monetary sanctions for failure to comply with Rule 26." Order on Motions (Docket Item No. 283) at 2.

Acting on Docket Item No. 181, the Magistrate Judge declined to strike the expert testimony of Black & Veatch witnesses Hoffman and Glover. After stating her factual

predicate for her refusal to strike the testimony, she found that Auburn's Motion "loses

the wind for its sails," id. at 3, because of disclosed fact testimony sufficient to provide

an adequate foundation for the expert testimony that was the subject of the Motion.

"Objections" (not Notices of Appeal as required by 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(A);

Jacobsen v. Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferris, Glovsky & Popeo, P.C., 594 F. Supp. 583, 585

(D. Me. 1984) have been filed by movant Auburn Manufacturing, Inc. (Docket Item No.

286) and by Inpro, Inc. who joined the Motion (Docket Item No. 285). Responses to the

Objections have been filed by Black & Veatch, Inc. (Docket Item Nos. 291 and 292).

Having carefully reviewed the written submissions in the context of appellate

review pursuant to § 636(b)(1)(A) and the record made on the Motions before the

Magistrate Judge, the Court **FINDS** that her actions for the reasons stated by her are

clearly well within the ambit of her judicial discretion in deciding each of the Motions

and that the Defendants have failed to demonstrate any clear error in those rulings.

The Appeal is herewith **DENIED**, and the action of the Magistrate Judge is

hereby **AFFIRMED**.

SO ORDERED.

/s/Gene Carter

GENE CARTER

Senior District Court Judge

Dated at Portland, Maine this 15th day of October, 2004.

Plaintiff

-----

\_

M DIANE KOKEN, as Liquidator on behalf of

Reliance Insurance

represented  $\ensuremath{\mathbf{ANTHONY}}$  R.  $\ensuremath{\mathbf{ZELLE}}$ 

by ROBINSON & COLE

ONE BOSTON PLACE

2

# Company (in liquidation)

BOSTON, MA 2108-4404 (617) 557-5900 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# EDWARD W. GOULD

GROSS, MINSKY & MOGUL, P.A. P.O. BOX 917 BANGOR, ME 04402-0917 207-942-4644 Email: ewgould@grossminsky.com LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# MALCOLM L. LYONS

PIERCE, ATWOOD LLP
77 WINTHROP ST.
AUGUSTA, ME 04330
622-6311
Email:
mlyons@pierceatwood.com
TERMINATED: 12/30/2002
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# CLIVE D. MARTIN

ROBINSON & COLE
ONE BOSTON PLACE
BOSTON, MA 2108-4404
(617) 557-5900
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JOHN O. O'BRIEN, JR.

ROBINSON & COLE
ONE BOSTON PLACE
BOSTON, MA 2108-4404
(617) 557-5900
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

#### Defendant

-----

PYRO SHIELD INC

TERMINATED: 11/04/2002

REDCO/O'CONNOR INC

TERMINATED: 08/05/2002

BLACK & VEATCH
CONSTRUCTION, INC

represented A. CYCLONE COVEY

by GRIFFIN COCHRANE &
MARSHALL, P.C.
127 PEACHTREE STREET
14TH FLOOR
ATLANTA, GA 30303
(404) 523-2000
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER

CURTIS, THAXTER,
STEVENS, BRODER, &
MICOLEAU
ONE CANAL PLAZA
P. O. BOX 7320
PORTLAND, ME 4112-7320
774-9000
Email: ctc@curthax.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JOHN D. GLEASON

CURTIS, THAXTER,
STEVENS, BRODER, &
MICOLEAU
ONE CANAL PLAZA
P. O. BOX 7320
PORTLAND, ME 4112-7320
774-9000
Email: jdg@curthax.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LEE C. DAVIS

GRIFFIN COCHRANE &
MARSHALL, P.C.
127 PEACHTREE STREET
14TH FLOOR
ATLANTA, GA 30303
(404) 523-2000
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# STEPHEN E. CHAMPAGNE

CURTIS, THAXTER,
STEVENS, BRODER, &
MICOLEAU
ONE CANAL PLAZA
P. O. BOX 7320
PORTLAND, ME 4112-7320
774-9000
TERMINATED: 04/28/2004
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# KEITH A. PITTMAN

GRIFFIN COCHRANE &
MARSHALL, P.C.
127 PEACHTREE STREET
14TH FLOOR
ATLANTA, GA 30303
(404) 523-2000
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL C. CASTELLON

GRIFFIN COCHRANE &
MARSHALL, P.C.
127 PEACHTREE STREET
14TH FLOOR
ATLANTA, GA 30303
(404) 523-2000
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### PATRICIA A. HAFENER

CURTIS, THAXTER, STEVENS, BRODER, & MICOLEAU ONE CANAL PLAZA

P. O. BOX 7320
PORTLAND, ME 4112-7320
774-9000
Email: pah@curthax.com
TERMINATED: 04/28/2004
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# O'CONNOR CONSTRUCTORS INC

# represented **BERNARD J. KUBETZ**

by EATON PEABODY
P. O. BOX 1210
BANGOR, ME 4402-1210
947-0111
Email:
bkubetz@eatonpeabody.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# FREDERICK J. BADGER, JR.

RICHARDSON, WHITMAN,
LARGE & BADGER
P.O. BOX 2429
ONE MERCHANTS PLAZA,
SUITE 603
BANGOR, ME 4402-2429
(207) 945-5900
Email: fbadger@rwlb.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# REDCO INC

# represented BERNARD J. KUBETZ

by (See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# THEODORE H. KIRCHNER

NORMAN, HANSON & DETROY
415 CONGRESS STREET
P. O. BOX 4600 DTS
PORTLAND, ME 4112
774-7000
Email:
tkirchner@nhdlaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

dba REDCO/O'CONNOR

ThirdParty Plaintiff

\_\_\_\_\_

BLACK & VEATCH CONSTRUCTION, INC represented A. CYCLONE COVEY

by (See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN D. GLEASON

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHAEL C. CASTELLON

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

ThirdParty Defendant

-----

PYRO SHIELD INC

TERMINATED: 03/27/2003

Cross Claimant

-----

BLACK & VEATCH CONSTRUCTION, INC represented A. CYCLONE COVEY

by (See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JOHN D. GLEASON

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# MICHAEL C. CASTELLON

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Cross Defendant

\_\_\_\_\_

PYRO SHIELD INC

TERMINATED: 11/19/2002

Cross Claimant

-----

BLACK & VEATCH CONSTRUCTION, INC represented A. CYCLONE COVEY

by (See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JOHN D. GLEASON

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# MICHAEL C. CASTELLON

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# PATRICIA A. HAFENER

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 04/28/2004
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Cross Defendant

-----

PYRO SHIELD INC

TERMINATED: 11/19/2002

REDCO INC

TERMINATED: 09/11/2002

dba

REDCO/O'CONNOR

Defendant

-----

AUBURN MANUFACTURING
INC

represented ELIZABETH A. GERMANI

by GERMANI & RIGGLE, LLC
93 EXCHANGE STREET
PORTLAND, ME 4101
773-7455
Email: egermani@grlaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

TRACY D. HILL

GERMANI & RIGGLE, LLC 93 EXCHANGE STREET PORTLAND, ME 4101

773-7455 Email: thill@gr-law.com ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### INPRO INC

# represented JAMES C. HUNT

by ROBINSON, KRIGER, AND
MCCALLUM
12 PORTLAND PIER
P. O. BOX 568
PORTLAND, ME 4112-568
772-6565
Email:
jhunt@rkmlegal.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### THOMAS R. KELLY

ROBINSON, KRIGER, AND MCCALLUM
12 PORTLAND PIER
P. O. BOX 568
PORTLAND, ME 4112-568
772-6565
Email:
tkelly@rkmlegal.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Cross Claimant

-----

BLACK & VEATCH
CONSTRUCTION, INC

# represented A. CYCLONE COVEY

by (See above for address)
 LEAD ATTORNEY
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JOHN D. GLEASON

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### LEE C. DAVIS

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# KEITH A. PITTMAN

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL C. CASTELLON

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# PATRICIA A. HAFENER

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 04/28/2004
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Cross Defendant

AUBURN MANUFACTURING
INC

INPRO INC

Cross Claimant

AUBURN MANUFACTURING
INC

V.

Cross Defendant

BLACK & VEATCH

represented A. CYCLONE COVEY

CONS'	rruc'i	'ION,	INC
-------	--------	-------	-----

by (See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JOHN D. GLEASON

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL C. CASTELLON

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

INPRO INC

O'CONNOR CONSTRUCTORS INC

REDCO INC

Cross Claimant
----O'CONNOR CONSTRUCTORS

V.

INC

Cross Defendant

AUBURN MANUFACTURING INC

Cross Claimant

REDCO INC

V.

AUBURN MANUFACTURING INC	
Cross Claimant	
REDCO INC	
V.	
Cross Defendant	
INPRO INC	
Cross Claimant	
INPRO INC	
V.	
Cross Defendant	
AUBURN MANUFACTURING INC	
BLACK & VEATCH CONSTRUCTION, INC	A. CYCLONE COVEY (See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Cross Defendant

JOHN D. GLEASON

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHAEL C. CASTELLON

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

O'CONNOR CONSTRUCTORS
INC

REDCO INC

REDCO/O'CONNOR INC

Cross Claimant
INPRO INC

V.

Cross Defendant
AUBURN MANUFACTURING

BLACK & VEATCH CONSTRUCTION, INC

INC

represented A. CYCLONE COVEY

by (See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN D. GLEASON

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHAEL C. CASTELLON

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

O'CONNOR CONSTRUCTORS INC

REDCO INC
REDCO/O'CONNOR INC
Cross Claimant
O'CONNOR CONSTRUCTORS INC
V.
Cross Defendant
INPRO INC